

## Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	<a href="#">South Asian Journal of Research in Microbiology</a>
Manuscript Number:	Ms_SAJRM_84658
Title of the Manuscript:	Virulence response of Escherichia coli to different concentrations of combined herbal drugs
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

### General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<https://www.journalsajrm.com/index.php/SAJRM/editorial-policy> )

## Review Form 1.6

### PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<b>Compulsory</b> REVISION comments	<p>1-The authors showed that; The used herbal drugs were purchased from Mile 3 Market. How can the authors use the products from the markets without confirmation about the purity of the product? Are their any other constituent like preservatives have antibacterial effect? What about the concentration of the active constituents n the product ???</p> <p>2 The authors showed that; <i>Escherichia coli</i> strain used in this research was purchased from Lahor Research Laboratory, Benin City, Edo State.</p> <p>What about the detailed characteristics of the used strain of E.coli?? Is it sensitive to antimicrobials, is it multidrug resistant , Pan drug resistant or what?????</p> <p>3- Why the authors don't test the herbal effect on other multidrug resistant organisms???</p> <p>4- The manuscript requires English editing to correct the grammar and flow of sentences.</p> <p>5- The authors did not mention the ethical approval statement in the manuscript.</p> <p>6- The title "Virulence response of <i>Escherichia coli</i> to different concentrations of combined herbal drugs" is broad and don't describe the work. It should be changed to be more precise.</p> <p>Suggested title is " Antimicrobial activity of some combined herbal drugs against E.coli "</p>	
<b>Minor</b> REVISION comments	<p>1. INTRODUCTION</p> <p>Authors showed write about the used combined herbal drugs; chemical structure, suggested mechanisms of action against microbes.</p> <p>2. materials and methods</p> <p>2.1 Herbal Drugs</p> <p>The herbal drugs used were Beta herbal mixture (B), Deep root herbal mixture (D), Goko cleanser (G). These drugs were purchased from Mile 3 Market, Porthacourt,</p> <p>How can the authors use the products from the markets without confirmation about the purity of the product? Is there any other constituent like preservatives have antibacterial effect? What about the concentration of the active constituents in the</p>	

## Review Form 1.6

	<p><b>product??? Purification??</b> <b>What are these herbs? What is the active constituent that have the antibacterial effect ??</b></p> <p><b>The reference for the manipulation with these products must be added</b></p> <p><b>2.2 Test Organisms</b></p> <p><i>Escherichia coli</i> strain used in this research was purchased from Lahor Research Laboratory, Benin City, Edo State. The identity of the microorganism was subjected to confirmatory testing such as MacConkey agar, indole and Grams stains according to Chesbrough [10]</p> <p><b>What about the detailed characteristics of the used strain of <i>E. coli</i>?? Is it sensitive to antimicrobials, is it multidrug resistant, Pan drug resistant or what?????</b></p> <p><b>Why the authors don't test the herbal effect on other multidrug resistant organisms like <i>P. aeuroginosa</i>???</b></p> <p><b>Also the effect on Gram positive organisms like MRSA, VRSA and fungi like <i>Candida speies</i> should be tested,</b></p> <p><b>2.4 Growth Response to the Herbal Drugs</b></p> <p>The growth response was carried out by using the spectrophotometric method. In the spectrophotometric method, overnight inoculum was serially diluted to <math>10^8</math> and treated with different concentrations of BG and BD serially diluted in different concentration of the overnight inoculums, and incubated for 18 hrs at 37 °C. The optical densities of the various concentrations were obtained using spectrophotometer at a wavelength of 600 nm.</p> <p><b>The unit of <math>10^8</math> must be mentioned</b> <b>The reference of the method should be added</b> <b>How can you standardize the test</b></p> <p><b>different concentrations of BG and BD serially diluted in different concentration of the overnight inoculums?????? How can you select these concentrations, where is the MIC determination of these used herbal products</b></p> <p><b>2.5 Antimicrobial Susceptibility Testing of the Herbal Drug-Treated <i>E. coli</i></b></p> <p><b>What about the reference for this test??</b> <b>Why the author select these antibiotics only ? what about other classes of antibiotics??</b> <b>How can you use the same strain of the E.coil as control group??</b> <b>Is the test is according to the guidelines CLISI ??? Mention</b></p> <p><b>3. Results; are weak</b></p> <p><b>References:</b></p> <p><b>NO RECENT REFERENCES ARE PRESENT</b></p>	
--	---	--

Review Form 1.6

Optional/General comments	The manuscript requires English editing to correct the grammar and flow of sentences.	
---------------------------	---	--

PART 2:

	Reviewer’s comment	Author’s comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?	(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Sherein Gamal Elgendy
Department, University & Country	Assiut University, Egypt