Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	**Journal of Geography, Environment and Earth Science International**
Manuscript Number:	**Ms_JGEESI_84237**
Title of the Manuscript:	**Validation of the Protoplanetary Theory of Solar System Formation**
Type of the Article	**Short communication**

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty'**, provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.
To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(https://www.journaljgeesi.com/index.php/JGEESI/editorial-policy)

Review Form 1.6

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	**Author's comment** *(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)*
Compulsory REVISION comments	Major revision The short communication is only two pages, while the reference section represents 7 pages All these topics must be discussed in details The short must be discussed in details 1. The novelty of the study 2. Laws of thermodynamic considerations, especially First law 3. Thermodynamics of composition-temperature-pressure independent on system size of or amount of matter present need explanation from thermodynamic point of view 4. Composition of Earth's interior (high-pressure condensed matter from a gas composition of sun's photosphere 5. **C**ondensate cooled gas of solar composition at high-pressures is molten iron at high temperatures, then at lower temperatures silicate minerals, and, if condensation complete, then, by gases and ices(need examples of gases) 6. Liquid iron metal raining out forming its core, followed by condensed minerals formed its mantle. 7. How connected thermodynamic high-pressure primordial condensation with oxidation state and minerals. 8. Table 1 require, requires linking to Einstein law of energy, $E = mC^2$ 9. Radioactivity series of Uranium 10. Advantageous Enstatite ($MgSiO_3$) as primary silicate to condense from solar matter at >1 atm.. 11. *Shiny iron metal and dissolved hydrogen from FeS must be linked to* corrosion tendency of metals and alloys on earth plane producing metal ion Fe^{+2} and $H_{2(g)}$ (recommended reference: Fetouh, H.A., Hefnawy, A., Attia, A.M. and Ali, E., 2020. Facile and low-cost green synthesis of eco-friendly chitosan-silver nanocomposite as novel and promising corrosion inhibitor for mild steel in chilled water circuits. *Journal of Molecular Liquids*, *319*, p.114355. 12. STP (standard temperature and pressure) must be mentioned 1.0 atm. and 273K. **13.** Observations of Earth's behavior must be discussed in details	
Minor REVISION comments	-	

Review Form 1.6

Optional/General comments	-	

PART 2:

	Reviewer's comment	**Author's comment** *(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)*
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?	*(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)*	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	**Howida Abouel Fetouh El Sayed**
Department, University & Country	**Egypt**