

Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	Asian Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Research
Manuscript Number:	Ms_AJFAR_87928
Title of the Manuscript:	Socio-Economic Analysis of Capture Fisheries In Jatigede Reservoir, Sumedang Regency
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<https://www.journalajfar.com/index.php/AJFAR/editorial-policy>)

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Compulsory REVISION comments	The authors have done a good job. Their analysis is thorough. While I generally agree with the authors' conclusion that the capture fishery business in Jatigede Reservoir is profitable, it may not be sustainable. Open access fisheries have often led to overfishing and decline of the fish stocks. The lack of an institutional manager in these waters is often the cause of overfishing. Even the authors admitted that floating net cages (even though not allowed) have led to social conflicts. Social capital doesn't mean open access abuse of the fish stocks. It means the cooperation of fishermen to protect their valuable resources from abuse. It usually means the appointment of an institutional manager (such as government authority) to create and manage an MPA (marine protected area). Such practices have long been adopted in advanced economies such as the US and the EU. The authors should mention how this practice can be introduced to the Jatigede Reservoir to avoid open access abuse. For more information, please consult the following article: Cabral, R.B., Halpern, B.S., Lester, S.E. et al. Designing MPAs for food security in open-access fisheries. Sci Rep 9, 8033 (2019). https://doi.org/10.1038/s41598-019-44406-w	
Minor REVISION comments		
Optional/General comments		

PART 2:

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?	(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Eric A. L. Li
Department, University & Country	The University of Hong Kong, Hong Kong