Risk perceptions of on environmental and health problems associated with Artisanal Crude oil Refining in Bayelsa State, Nigeria

Abstract

Background and aim: When crude oil is artisanally refined, it releases compounds that contribute to environmental pollution and health problems. The perceptions regarding these problems could be instrumental in tackling the involvement in these illicit activities. This study thus assessed the perception of the environmental and health risks associated withartisanal refining of petroleum products in communities in Bayelsa State.

Material and methods: Thisdescriptive The studywas conducted among 615 adult residents of 3 selected communities in Bayelsa State. Multistage sampling was applied in selecting the respondents who provided responses to self- and interviewer-the administered questionnaires. Necessary ethical considerations were made during the conduct of this study.

Results: Altogether most of the Results from the study indicate respondents that respondents had good perception regarding the possibility that environmental and health risks could occur as a result of crude oil artisanal refining activities (Criterion mean: 2.5 (what %); Grand mean [environmental risks]: 3.25[81.15%]; Grand mean [health risks]: 3.13 [78.32%]) respectively.

Conclusion: The respondents in the studied study found that the communities were found to have good perceptions of environmental and health risks associated with the artisanal refining of crude oil in Bayelsa State. There is the refore need for sustained health education to maintain good perceptions of the health and environmental risks associated with petroleum-related artisanal refining.

Keywords: artisanal refining, crude oil, health effects, environmental problems, perceptions

INTRODUCTION

The exploration and exploitation of crude oil in Nigeria has gone on for years and these have largely contributed to the economy and development of the country at the expense of destructive effects on the environment and the occurrence of health problems. These problems have been linked to the occurrence of accidental oil spills during the oil exploration and transportation activities, gas flaring, fire outbreaks at exploration sites as well as illegal oil bunkering activities(Kadafa, 2012; Odalonu, 2015). Illegal oil bunkering usually involves sabotage to oil pipelines and the diversion of crude oil from these pipelines for commercial gain (Obenade & Amangabara, 2014; Odalonu, 2015). This illegally obtained crude oil at certain times undergoes illicit refining which is done by unlicensed persons and is known ascrude oil artisanal refining(Amangabara & Njoku, 2012).

This refining process is regarded as being highly inefficient due to the inability to refine as much as 80% of the heavy end of the crude and the tendency to produce refined petroleum products of

low quality(Amangabara & Njoku, 2012). During the refining process, part of the oil seeps into the ground with the potential consequence of contaminating the underground aquifer (Amangabara & Njoku, 2012). In addition, dense clouds of soot, gaseous compounds and particulate matter are produced and released together with the unrefined portions into the environment. These contribute to the release of black-and-soot in large amounts into the environment. Amajor carcinogenic constituent found in both black carbon and soot is polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons (PAHs) which have been implicated in the occurrence of a number of health problems(Amangabara & Njoku, 2012; Howard et al., 2017; Niranjan & Thakur, 2017; Nwankwoala et al., 2017). Artisanal refining activity https://has-have-been-implicated-in-adversely-attributed-to-affecting-soil micro-organisms (Douglas & Cornelius, 2018), destroying the wetland ecosystem (Asimiea & Omokhua, 2013; Yabrade & Tanee, 2016); https://has-have-been-implicated-in-adversely-attributed-to-affecting-soil-micro-organisms (Douglas & Cornelius, 2018), destroying the wetland ecosystem (Asimiea & Omokhua, 2013; Yabrade & Tanee, 2016); https://has-have-been-implicated-in-adversely-attributed-to-affecting-soil-micro-organisms (Douglas & Cornelius, 2018), destroying the wetland ecosystem (Asimiea & Omokhua, 2013). They also contribute to the severe depletion of biodiversity and the aesthetic scenery of forests, destruction of wildlife habitats as well as the disruption of water cycles and aquatic life(Asimiea & Omokhua, 2013).

A report by the United Nations Development Programme has stated that majority of the Niger Delta populace is uneducated, poorly informed, and deficient in relevant technical skills needed for productivity(show ref.). This limitation, in concertcombined with high unemployment rates and the perception of not benefiting from the revenue proceeds of oil production prompts the local population, especially the youths, to be involved in acts which promote restiveness and violence (Obenade & Amangabara, 2014). These acts include pipeline vandalism and crude oil theft which involves illegal bunkering and refining of crude oil which are facilitated by the large-scale local and international crude oil trade which provides quick and profitable gains (Daura, 2000; United Nations Environment Programme, 2006). Their ignorance of the harmful effects of these illegal bunkering and refining activities could be an important factor contributing to the sustained involvement in these activities. This holds as true despite efforts by the Nigerian government to eliminate these activities (Daura, 2000; Obenade & Amangabara, 2014; United Nations Environment Programme, 2006).

Researchers have found major perceptions of the environmental effects of oil spillage and gas flaring activities to include air pollution (72.4%) (Obafemi et al., 2012) as well as the destruction of agricultural and aquatic life which adversely affects various sources of livelihood of the affected populace.(The-Strategic-Partnership-on-Lobby-&-Advocacy-Programme-in-Nigeria, 2020). In Rivers State, during the soot pollution incident, it was reported that most respondents perceived this that soot pollution to have caused chronic cough (69.9%), irritation to eyes, nose and throat (64.2%) as well as skin irritation (32.6%). Coincidentally, most of the respondents perceived that the pollution was caused by artisanal crude oil refining activities as well as burning of seized crude oil and artisanally-refined products (Whyte et al., 2020). This kind of studies have been scantily conducted in Bayelsa State which is also one of the States playing host to numerous oil and gas activities. In order to understand the perceptions of the residents in this State regarding the environmental and health problems that could arise as a result of the activities

of artisanal refiners of crude oil, it is necessary to conduct this study. This study thus aims to determine the perceptions of the <u>communities on</u> environmental and health risks associated with the artisanal refining of crude oil in Bayelsa State, Nigeria.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

This is a descriptive study conducted in three selected communities located in Bayelsa State, Nigeria. The study population included adult residents in these communities for a period not less than two years. A sample size of 615 respondents were selected from the communities to provide responses to questions regarding their perceptions of environmental and health risks associated with artisanal refining of crude oil. The sample size was equally distributed across the 3 selected communities and multistage sampling was used in the selection of the study respondents from these communities.

The first stage was simple random sampling to randomly select wards in the Local Government Areas (LGAs) by balloting. Second stage was simple random sampling by balloting, to select communities within each selected ward and the third stage involved simple random sampling to select houses within selected communities. Each house formed a cluster, and everyone who met the inclusion criteria were recruited. Where more than one household was present in a house, simple random sampling by balloting was used to select only one household. During the course of sampling, when any respondent chose not to participate in the study, sampling was extended to compensate for that. Sampling continued until the minimum sample size was attained.

A structured self- and interviewer-administered questionnaire was used for data collection and comprised three sections (A to C). Section A elicited data on the sociodemographic characteristics of the respondents, sections B and C elicited data on the perception of environmental and health risks associated with artisanal crude oil refining respectively. The questionnaire was adapted from existing templates of previous studies (Kponee et al., 2015; Nriagu et al., 2016; Okonkwo et al., 2018) and responses to the questions were placed on a 4-point likert scale ranging from strongly agree (4) to strongly disagree (1).

The instrument was prepared in English language and translated into English-based pidgin which is a common means of communication within the Niger Delta region of Nigeria (Akande, 2010). This was as a result of the anticipation of language barriers to some residents of the study communities whom may not understand the questionnaire items written in English language. In order to ensure that the translated questionnaire retained its original meaning, it was translated back to English language. After this was done, it was ensured that the original meaning was retained after both translations. The study questionnaires were pre-tested among 20 respondents. The completed questionnaires were assessed for adequacy, understandability and ease of application. The instrument was appropriately modified to enhance these aspects of the validity of the instrument. The reliability of the completed questionnaire in this study was assessed using the index of internal consistency calculated with the Cronbach's alpha coefficient which was 0.937 which showed that the instrument was reliable for use in the present study.

3 field assistantswere recruited and appropriately trained prior to commencement of data collection for 1 day. Training was done at a designated meeting point and was anchored on the following training objectives: eliciting accurate answers without suggestions, eligibility criteria for recruitment of study samples and the description of sampling techniques to be applied. Others included understanding the procedures for data collection, appropriate translation of questionnaire items and ethical considerations to be applied during data collection. Initial training was given at first and followed by practice sessions as well as evaluation and correction of any misunderstood training objective.

Ethics approval for the research was obtained from the Research Ethics Committee of the University of Port Harcourt (Approval number: UPH/CEREMAD/REC/MM72/097) and permission to conduct the research was obtained from the Bayelsa State Ministry of Health (Approval number: BSHREC/Vol. 1/21/02). Permission to conduct this study was also sought from necessary authorities of the Communities involved. Every part of the research protocol was explained to the respondents and their consent was sought before commencement of instrument administration and health assessment.

RESULTS

Out of the 615 respondents who took part in this study, 205 of them were selected from each community. It was found that the majority of the respondents were male 318 (51.7%) and majority of the respondents of whom were aged between 18 and 44 years 490 (82.9%) with a mean age of 32.77±11.13 years. The largest proportion of the respondents had an income of less than 500 naira per day 234 (38.6%), were single 281 (45.7%) and were self-employed 290 (47.2%). Most of the respondents had received secondary school education 319 (52.3%). These details are shown in Table 1.

Table 1: Demographic data of respondents

Variables	Frequency	Percentage (%)			
Sex					
Male	318	51.7			
Female	297	48.3			
Total	615	100			

18-44 490 82.9	
45-60 90 15.2	
>60 11 1.9	
Total 591 100	
Income (naira)	
<500 234 38.6	4
500-1000 165 27.2	
1000-2000 59 9.7	
2000-3000 33 5.4	7 -
>3000 116 19.1	
Total 607 100	
Marital status	
Single 281 45.7	
Married 270 43.9	
Divorced 17 2.8	
Widow(er) 8 1.3	
Cohabiting 39 6.3	
Total 615 100	
Employment status	
Unemployed 208 33.9	
Self-employed 290 47.2	
Employed by others 116 18.9	
Total 614 100	
10tal 614 100	
Educational qualification	
None 30 4.9	
Primary 27 4.4	
Secondary 319 52.3	
Tertiary 206 33.8	
Vocational/Technical 28 4.6	
Total 610 100	

Perception of risk of environmental problems due to artisanal refining of crude oil

Assessment of the respondents' perception of the risk of environmental problems associated with artisanal refining of crude oil showed that altogether most of the respondents had a good perception regarding the occurrence of these risks (Criterion mean: 2.5; Grand mean: 3.25 [81.5%]). This good perception among the respondents was as a result of majority of them agreeing or strongly <u>disagreeing</u> with the eight questionnaire items asked to elicit their

perception of the associated environmental risks. Also, the On_assessment be described in the respondents' perception of the risk of health problems associated with artisanal refining of crude oil showed that altogether most of the respondents had good perception regarding the possibility that these risks could occur (Criterion mean: 2.5; Grand mean:3.13 [78.32%]). This good perception among the respondents was as a result of majority of them agreeing or strongly agreeing with the eight statements asked to elicit their perception of the associated health risks. This data is shown in Tables 2 and 3.

DISCUSSION

An assessment of the respondents' perception of the risk of health and environmental problems associated with artisanal refining of crude oil showed that most of the respondents had reasonable perception of health and environmental risks from the pollution caused by artisanal refining of crude oil. Theis finding of this study are is in agreement with the findings of studies by other authors—(quote the other authors) who have assessed risk perceptions among respondents in oil-producing areas within the Niger Delta region of Nigeria.

Another study conducted in Rivers State, (indicate when) which assessed the perception of residents regarding the effects of soot pollution due to artisanal crude oil refining activities as well as burning of seized crude oil and artisanally-refined products. The study showed that most of the respondents perceived the soot to have caused chronic cough, irritation to eyes, nose and throat as well as skin irritation(Whyte et al., 2020). Another study conducted to assess the interplay between livelihoods in the Niger Delta and artisanal refining found that as much as 60.4% of the respondents reported that their livelihoods (largely agriculture-based) had been affected by oil spills from artisanal refining and other related activities(The-Strategic-Partnership-on-Lobby-&-Advocacy-Programme-in-Nigeria, 2020).

Researchersin a study conducted to assess respondents' perception of environmental pollution in Warri, Nigeria also reported that major perceptions of the respondents regarding environmental effects of oil spillage and gas flaring centred on air pollution (Obafemi et al., 2012). In others studies conducted in Delta State, Nigeria; it was also reported that the respondents were aware that the flared gas in their communities contributed to air pollution by black carbon which caused detrimental human health and environmental effects. The awareness of these human and environmental impacts was reported to increase with increasing proximity to the gas flare site (Akuirene et al., 2019; Edino et al., 2010).

The present study and other supporting studies suggest that the perception of health and environmental risks, from artisanal refining and gas flaring activities by the respondents in affected communities is high(Ferrer & Klein, 2015; Sheeran et al., 2014). This notwithstanding, the problems of artisanal refining activities still persist and could be related with the desire of the youthful residents in oil-producing communities to be involved in acts which promote restiveness and violence. This is further complicated by the perception of not benefiting from the

Formatted: Font color: Red

Formatted: Font color: Red

Formatted: Font color: Red

revenue proceeds of oil production, lack of education, high unemployment rates and the desire to make quick financial gains (Daura, 2000; Obenade & Amangabara, 2014; United Nations Environment Programme, 2006).

Conclusion

The perception regarding the possibility that health and environmental risks could occur as a result of the pollution caused by the activities of artisanal refiners of crude oil in this study was found to be good. There is however the need for sustained health education to maintain these good perception levels. The populace can also be educated on the positive environmental impact associated with using environmentally-safe methods for cooking, energy and general domestic use.

References

- Akuirene, O. A., Adjene, J. O., Obi, N. I., & Nwose, E. U. (2019). Impact of gas flaring in Ubeji metropolis of Delta State Nigeria: a comparative survey of environment health effects. 5(10), 283–290.
- Amangabara, G. T., & Njoku, J. D. (2012). Assessing groundwater vulnerability to the activities of artisanal refining in Bolo and environs, Ogu/Bolo Local Government Area of Rivers State; Nigeria. *British Journal of Environment and Climate Change*, 2(1), 28–36.
- Asimiea, A., & Omokhua, G. (2013). ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT OF ILLEGAL REFINERIES ON THE VEGETATION OF THE NIGER DELTA, NIGERIA. *Journal of Agriculture and Social Research*, 13(2), 121–126.
- Daura, J. L. (2000). Developing an effective mechanism of oil pollution management in the Niger Delta.
- Douglas, S. I., & Cornelius, B. T. (2018). Impacts of Artisanal Crude Oil Refining Activities on Soil Microorganisms. *Journal of Advances in Biology & Biotechnology*, 1–9.
- Edino, M., Nsofor, G., & Bombom, L. (2010). Perceptions and attitudes towards gas flaring in the Niger Delta, Nigeria. *Environmentalist*, 30, 67–75. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10669-009-9244-2
- Ferrer, R., & Klein, W. (2015). Risk perceptions and health behavior. *COPSYC*, 1–15. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.copsyc.2015.03.012
- Howard, I. C., Azuatola, O. D., & Abiodun, I. K. (2017). Investigation on impacts of artisanal refining of crude oil on river bed sediments. *Our Nature*, *15*(1–2), 34–43.
- Kadafa, A. A. (2012). Environmental impacts of oil exploration and exploitation in the Niger Delta of Nigeria. Global Journal of Science Frontier Research Environment & Earth Sciences, 12(3), 19–28.
- Kponee, K. Z., Chiger, A., Kakulu, I. I., Vorhees, D., & Heiger-Bernays, W. (2015). Petroleum contaminated water and health symptoms: a cross-sectional pilot study in a rural Nigerian

- community. Environmental Health, 14(1), 86.
- Niranjan, R., & Thakur, A. K. (2017). The toxicological mechanisms of environmental soot (black carbon) and carbon black: focus on oxidative stress and inflammatory pathways. *Frontiers in Immunology*, 8, 763.
- Nriagu, J., Udofia, E. A., Ekong, I., & Ebuk, G. (2016). Health risks associated with oil pollution in the Niger Delta, Nigeria. *International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health*, 13(3), 346.
- Nwankwoala, H. O., Harry, M. T., Amangabara, G. T., & Warmate, T. (2017). Impacts of Artisanal Refining Activities on Soil and Water Quality in Parts of Okrika and Ogu-Bolo Areas of Rivers State, Nigeria. *Journal of Scientific Achievements*, 2(9), 13–19.
- Obafemi, A., Eludoyin, O., & Akinbosola, B. (2012). Public Perception of Environmental Pollution in Warri, Nigeria. *J. Appl. Sci. Environ. Manage*, 16(2), 233–240.
- Obenade, M., & Amangabara, G. T. (2014). Perspective: The environmental implications of oil theft and artisanal refining in the Niger Delta Region. *Asian Review of Environmental and Earth Sciences*, 1(2), 25–29.
- Odalonu, B. H. (2015). Upsurge of oil theft and illegal bunkering in the Niger Delta region of Nigeria: is there a way out?
- Okonkwo, F. O., Njan, A. A., Ejike, C. E. C. C., Nwodo, U. U., & Onwurah, I. N. E. (2018). Health implications of occupational exposure of butchers to emissions from burning tyres. *Annals of Global Health*, *84*(3), 387.
- Sheeran, P., Harris, P., & Epton, T. (2014). Does heightening risk appraisals change people's intentions and behavior? A meta-analysis of experimental studies. *Psychological Bulletin*, 140, 511.
- The-Strategic-Partnership-on-Lobby-&-Advocacy-Programme-in-Nigeria. (2020). DYNAMICS OF ARTISINAL REFINING ON SUSTAINABLE LIVELIHOODS IN THE NIGER DELTA. In *OILY LIVELIHOODS* (Issue August).
- United Nations Environment Programme, (UNEP). (2006). Report on Atmosphere and Air Pollution. African Regional Implementation Review for the 14th Session of the Commission on Sustainable Development (CSD-14), 24.
- Whyte, M., Numbere, T., & Sam, K. (2020). Residents' perception of the effects of soot pollution in. *African Journal of Environmental Science and Technology*, *14*(12), 422–430. https://doi.org/10.5897/AJEST2020.2923
- Yabrade, M., & Tanee, F. B. G. (2016). Assessing the Impact of Artisanal Petroleum Refining on Vegetation and Soil Quality: A Case Study of Warri South West Salt Wetland of Delta State, Nigeria. *Environmental Toxicology*, 10(4), 205–212.
- Table 2: Perception of the risk of environmental problems associated with artisanal refining among the respondents

Perception of	SA (4)	A (3)	D (2)	SD	Σf	Σfx	μ	μ%	Remark
risk of				(1)					
environment									
al problems									
• Pollution	201	379	28	7	615	200	3.2	81.4	Good
from	(32.7%	(61.6%	(4.6%	(1.1%	(100.0%	4	6	6	perception
artisanal)))))				. 1
mining is an									
environment									
al risk									() ·
Water	195	404	13	3	615	202	3.2	82.1	Good
pollution	(31.7%	(65.7%	(2.1%	(0.5%	(100.0%	1	9	5	perception
can be)))))				
caused by									
crude oil							Χ.		
pollution or									
its bi-									
products									
following									
artisanal									
refining of									
crude oil	106	102	22		61.5	200	2.2	01.0	G 1
• Air	186	403	22	4	615	200	3.2	81.3	Good
pollution	(30.2%	(65.5%	(3.6%	(0.7%	(100.0%	1	5	4	perception
can be)	, ,)	, ,)				
caused by crude oil									
crude oil pollution or) ×						
its									
artisanally									
refined	7								
products									
• Fish	193	404	15	3	615	201	3.2	81.9	Good
contaminati	(31.4%				(100.0%				perception
on can be)))))	,	Ü		perception
caused by	,	,	,	,	,				
crude oil									
pollution or									
_									
following									
bi-products									

```
artisanal
refining
          of
crude oil
                          410
                                    19
                                                     615
                                                                    3.2
                                                                           81.3
                                                                                    Good
Destruction
                 182
                                             4
                                                              200
                         (66.7%
                                  (3.0%
                                          (0.7%
                                                   (100.0%
                                                               0
                                                                     5
                                                                            0
      fishing
               (29.6%
                                                                                 perception
of
sites can be
                  )
                           )
                                     )
                                             )
                                                      )
caused
          by
crude
          oil
pollution or
bi-products
following
artisanal
refining
          of
crude oil
                                                                    3.2
                                    26
                                                     615
                                                              197
                                                                           80.2
Farmland
                 167
                          416
                                             6
                                                                                    Good
               (27.2%
                         (67.6%
                                  (4.2%
                                          (1.0%
                                                   (100.0%
                                                                                 perception
destruction
can
          be
                  )
                           )
                                     )
                                             )
caused
          by
          oil
crude
pollution or
bi-products
following
artisanal
refining
crude oil
                          407
                                                     615
                                                                           79.5
                 165
                                                              195
                                                                    3.1
Destruction
                                                                                    Good
                         (66.2%
                                  (5.5%
                                          (1.5%
                                                                     8
                                                                            9
               (26.8%
                                                   (100.0%
                                                               8
                                                                                 perception
of the beauty
of nature can
be caused by
crude
          oil
pollution or
bi-products
following
artisanal
refining
           of
crude oil
                 181
                          408
                                                                           81.1
Soil
                                    22
                                             4
                                                     615
                                                              199
                                                                    3.2
                                                                                    Good
               (29.4%
                         (66.3%
                                  (3.6%
                                          (0.7%
                                                   (100.0%
                                                               6
                                                                     5
                                                                            4
                                                                                 perception
infertility
can
          be
                  )
                           )
                                     )
                                             )
                                                      )
caused
          by
```

crude oil		Stro
pollution or		ngl
its		у
artisanally		agre
refined		e
products		(SA
Grand	3.2 81.1	Good),
mean/mean	5 5	overall
%	p	erceptio Agr
		n ee
		(A),

Disagree (D), Strongly Disagree (SD); μ : Mean value; μ %: Mean percentage

Table 3: Perception of the risk of health problems associated with artisanal refining among the respondents

Perception	SA (4)	A (3)	D (2)	SD (1)	Σf	Σfx	μ	μ %	Remark
of health risk									
• Pollution	244	340	23	8	615	205	3.3	83.3	Good
from	(39.7%	(55.3%	(3.7%)	(1.3%	(100.0%	0	3	3	perceptio
artisanal))))				n
refining									
of crude									
oil is a									
health									
risk to me									
• Pollution	217	363	28	7	615	202	3.2	82.1	Good
from	(35.3%	(59.0%	(4.6%)	(1.1%	(100.0%	0	8	1	perceptio
artisanal))))				n
refining)								
of crude									
oil is a									
health									
risk to my									
family									
 pollution 	199	383	27	6	615	200	3.2	81.5	Good

```
from
                        (62.3%
                                  (4.4%)
                                           (1.0%
                                                   (100.0%
                                                               5
                                                                                  perceptio
               (32.4)
                                                                      6
  artisanal
                           )
                                             )
                                                       )
                                                                                      n
  refining
  of crude
  oil is a
  health
  risk to the
  general
  populatio
                                                                                    Good
                150
                          299
                                   155
                                             11
                                                      615
                                                              181
                                                                           73.9
  Distortion
                                                                     2.9
     child
              (24.4%
                        (48.6%
                                 (25.2%
                                           (1.8%
                                                   (100.0%
                                                               8
                                                                            0
                                                                                  perceptio
                                                                      6
  developm
                 )
                           )
                                    )
                                             )
                                                       )
                                                                                      n
  ent can be
  caused by
  crude oil
  pollution
  or
         bi-
  products
  following
  artisanal
  refining
  of crude
  oil
• Breathing
                165
                          363
                                   78
                                             9
                                                      615
                                                              191
                                                                     3.1
                                                                           77.8
                                                                                    Good
                                 (12.7%
                                           (1.5%
                                                   (100.0%
              (26.8%
                        (59.0%
                                                               4
                                                                      1
                                                                            0
                                                                                  perceptio
  problems
  can
                 )
                                             )
                                                       )
                                                                                      n
  caused by
  crude oil
  pollution
         bi-
  or
  products
  following
  artisanal
  refining
  of crude
  oil
                143
                          327
                                   134
                                             11
                                                      615
                                                              183
                                                                     2.9
                                                                           74.4
                                                                                    Good
 Inability
                        (53.2%
                                           (1.8%
                                                               2
                                                                      8
                                                                            7
              (23.2%
                                 (21.8%
                                                   (100.0%
                                                                                  perceptio
       sleep
                           )
                                    )
                                             )
  well can
                 )
                                                       )
                                                                                      n
```

```
be caused
  by
      crude
  oil
  pollution
         bi-
  or
  products
  following
  artisanal
  refining
  of
      crude
  oil
• Health
                167
                         393
                                   52
                                             3
                                                     615
                                                              195
                                                                    3.1
                                                                          79.4
                                                                                   Good
                                                                            3
                                          (0.5%
                                                   (100.0%
  problems
              (27.2%
                        (63.9%
                                 (8.5%)
                                                                     8
                                                                                 perceptio
         be
                 )
                          )
                                             )
                                                      )
                                                                                     n
  can
  caused by
  crude oil
  pollution
         bi-
  or
  products
  following
  artisanal
  refining
  of crude
  oil
• Problems
                134
                         339
                                   126
                                            16
                                                     615
                                                              182
                                                                    2.9
                                                                          74.0
                                                                                   Good
                                 (20.5%
                                          (2.6%
                                                   (100.0%
                                                                            2
  with
              (21.8%
                        (55.1%
                                                               1
                                                                     6
                                                                                 perceptio
                                             )
                                                      )
                                                                                     n
  digestion
                 )
  can
         be
  caused by
  crude oil
  pollution
  or
         bi-
  products
  following
  artisanal
  refining
  of
      crude
  oil
 Grand
                                                                          78.3
                                                                    3.1
                                                                                   Good
 mean/mea
                                                                    3
                                                                          2
                                                                                  overall
```

Strongly agree (SA), Agree (A), Disagree (D), Strongly Disagree (SD); μ : Mean value; μ %: Mean percentage

