

Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	Asian Journal of Research and Reports in Ophthalmology
Manuscript Number:	Ms_AJRROP_83119
Title of the Manuscript:	A Comparative Study and Review of Siddha Ophthalmology from the Classical Siddha Literature Agatthiar Nayana Vidhi-500
Type of the Article	Review Article

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<https://www.journalajrrop.com/index.php/AJRROP/editorial-policy>)

[Review Form 1.6](#)

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer’s comment	Author’s comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Compulsory REVISION comments	<p>The manuscript reviewed the Siddha Ophthalmology from the Classical Siddha Literature <i>Agatthiar Nayana Vidhi-500</i>. Overall, data in this paper were reasonable.</p> <p>Thus, the manuscript brings some valuable findings and it could be published in the journal. Still, there are some points need to be addressed:</p> <p>1. Please highlight the significance of this review.</p> <p>2. In 1.2.1 and 1.2.2, “medicines like <i>Neer, kattu, kalangu, urukku, chunnam, karpam, satthu</i>, and <i>Guru-kuligai</i>” “<i>tharppanam, thaarai, kalikkam, mai or anjanam, ennai muzhukku</i>” “ghee medicines like <i>karisalai nei, ponnankanni nei, nellikkai ilagam, injithenn</i>”. Does the herbs mentioned above have standard Latin or international names?</p> <p>3. In 1.3.1~1.3.3, please provide the exact Latin name and sources of these herbs and animals.</p> <p>4. Why only literature data from January 2020 to December 2021 were collected? Is the time too short and the data fully collected?</p> <p>5. In 3.3, are the data collection channels authoritative and representative?</p>	<p>Thanks for your encouraging words. The review helps us to update our knowledge.</p> <p>1. The significance of the review is modified and added as follows. The study highlights the efficacy of "Herbal and Herbo mineral drugs" which is an ancient tradition, Siddha medicine used in some parts of India. This ancient concept should be carefully evaluated in the light of modern medical science and can be utilized partially if found suitable.</p> <p>2. The names <i>Neer, kattu, kalangu, urukku, chunnam, karpam, satthu</i>, and <i>Guru-kuligai</i> are mentioned in Siddha texts which are 1400 years old. They are different types of medicine used in Siddha. They are compound medicines prepared from herbs, minerals and animal products. It is corrected now with international English names. <i>neer</i> (medicated liquid), <i>kattu</i> (condensed mineral drug), <i>kalangu</i> (red hot fired and cooled mineral medicine), <i>urukku</i> (molten metal medicine), <i>chunnam</i> (calcinated lime stone), <i>karpam</i> (rejuvenate medicine), <i>satthu</i> (extract), and <i>Guru-kuligai</i> (bead medicines) <i>tharppanam</i> (continuous dripping of liquid medicine into eye or orbit), <i>thaarai</i> (intermittent dripping of liquid medicine into eye or orbit), <i>kalikkam</i> (ophthalmic drops), <i>mai or anjanam</i> (collyrium), <i>ennai muzhukku</i> (application of oil on head followed by hot water bath) etc. are used externally. Herbal decoctions, ghee medicines like <i>karisalai nei</i> (a ghee-based medicine prepared from <i>Eclipta alba</i>), <i>ponnankanni nei</i> (a ghee-based medicine prepared from <i>Alternanthera sessilis</i>), <i>nellikkai ilagam</i> (a ghee and honey based medicine prepared from <i>Phyllanthus emblicus</i>), <i>injithenn</i> (a honey-based medicine prepared from fresh <i>Zingiber officinale</i> pieces).</p> <p>3. Sorry for the mistake. Now we added common English/Latin names. <i>Kadukkay</i> (Chebulic myrobalan - <i>Terminalia chebula</i>), <i>Thandrikkay</i> (Belleric myrobalan - <i>Terminalia bellirica</i>), <i>Nellikkay</i> (Indian Gooseberry - <i>Phyllanthus emblica</i>), <i>Thanneervittankizhangu</i> (Buttermilk root - <i>Asparagus racemosus</i>), <i>Maramanjai</i> (Tree turmeric - <i>Berberis aristata</i>), <i>Athimathuram</i> (Liquorice - <i>Glycyrrhiza glabra</i>), <i>Karpuram</i> (Camphor - <i>Cinnamomum camphora</i>), <i>Kumizham</i> (White teak - <i>Gmelina arborea</i>), <i>Vellai karisalai</i> (False daisy - <i>Eclipta alba</i>), <i>Seeragam</i> (Cuminum - <i>Cuminum cyminum</i>), <i>Aamanakku</i> (Castor oil - <i>Ricinus communis</i>) and <i>Thenkay</i> (Coconut oil - <i>Cocos nucifera</i>) are the most used herbs. <i>Gorojanai</i> (Bezoar - ox gall), <i>mayiliragu</i> (<i>Pavo cristatus</i> - peacock feather), <i>Maankombu</i> (<i>Cervus</i> - deer's horn)</p> <p>4. Here the data collected are mentioning the signs and symptoms of different types of eye diseases mentioned in modern science. Now the sentence is modified as follows. The data collected for the comparison of ancient & modern science and review of modern medicine references were from January 2020 to December 2021.</p>

Review Form 1.6

	6. More Discussion should be allow in this review.	<p>5. The mentioned books are published by Dept. of Indian Medicine, Govt. of Tamil Nādu, Govt. of Sri Lanka and Saraswathi Mahal Library, Thanjavur.</p> <p>6. Few more sentences are added in the discussion part as follows. The text describes 96 types of eye diseases in verses written in Tamil. The description of verses for each eye disease is concised in Table 4 with a mere comparison of modern diseases. The modern findings of eye diseases are more are less similar with ancient findings which are mentioned in <i>Agatthiar Nayana Vidhi</i>. The description of various symptoms of <i>Suzhal Vanderithal</i> (vitreous opacities), <i>Mayir puznuvettu</i> (Tinea ciliarum), <i>Amaram</i> (Granular conjunctivitis), <i>Kuvalaivipuruthi</i> (dacryocystitis), <i>Vellelluthu</i> (presbyopia), <i>thurmamisam</i> (episcleritis), and <i>Mudamayir</i> (trichiasis) are very much similar to that in modern medicine diagnosis. It is surprising to learn how in those days they have explained these diseases in clear terms. [1] From the above-mentioned evidences, we can get a clear view about the knowledge and resources of the ancient Siddha classical literatures, possess with respect to Ophthalmology. In these traditional Siddha texts, the Siddhars have clearly described the qualities of a healthy eye (para 5.1), the anatomy of the eye (para 5.2), progress of eye diseases and age (para 5.3), causes of eye diseases (para 5.4), aetiology of ophthalmic diseases (para 5.5), the treatment methodology of various ophthalmic diseases, sources of drugs of herbal origin, drugs of mineral origin and drugs of animal origin, classification of eye diseases according to the parts of the eye, classification of eye diseases according to the vitiated humours (para 5.6), clinically manifesting signs and symptoms of 96 eye diseases, and comparison of Siddha classification with the ophthalmic diseases described in modern science (Table 4). The treatment methods for each disease along the prognosis of treatment were well explained in the texts, but here not mentioned due to the limitation of the study. The data available for the treatment of few challenging diseases may be utilized in future by some researchers wherever and whenever applicable.</p>
<u>Minor</u> REVISION comments		
<u>Optional/General</u> comments		

PART 2:

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment <i>(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	