

Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	Asian Journal of Biology
Manuscript Number:	Ms_AJOB_84118
Title of the Manuscript:	The evaluation of the antibacterial effect on Propionibacterium acnes and antioxidant activity of various mushrooms, Chinese Herbs, and plant essential oils
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<https://www.journalajob.com/index.php/AJOB/editorial-policy>)

Review Form 1.6

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Compulsory REVISION comments	<p>Abstract/Methodology: Please explain the abbreviations DPPH, FRAP and ABTS</p> <p>Abstract/Results: ...than in tested mushrooms. This passage is difficult to read. Please rethink the offer of values. I would prefer to get an overview of all results and the context between them here.</p> <p>Line 22: <i>Morechella</i>...</p> <p>Line 25: please stay consistent at citing</p> <p>Line 26: <i>Lavandula</i>...</p> <p>Line 33: ... natural materials against <i>P. acnes</i>...</p> <p>Line 38: reagents</p> <p>Table 1: please give all origins</p> <p>Line 55: please give the name of the producer of the bags you used</p> <p>Line 62/66: please stay time consistent! 20g of material were weighted... whole sentences</p> <p>Lines 64/65/67: please amend °C where missing</p> <p>Line 70: please adjust name in size</p> <p>Line 69: How many approaches and how many repetitions did you do? Please explain.</p> <p>Line 76: Six samples out of how many?</p> <p>Line 87: Why did you take the smallest value not calculating the average or giving IQR?</p> <p>Line 92: Please explain the gradients</p> <p>Line 99: What did happen with the mixed solution between 12 and 16 hours? Please explain.</p> <p>Line 103: Which concentrations did you test?</p> <p>Line 105/113: Please give the concentration gradients.</p> <p>Line 109: first name of reference is missing, please adjust</p> <p>Line 128: <i>Lavandula</i>...</p> <p>Line 126: <i>artemisiae</i>...</p> <p>Line 127: <i>granati</i>...</p> <p>Line 131: MIC</p> <p>Line 147: Table 4 is not linked to the text.</p> <p>Line 130: Please give the number of approaches and repetitions</p>	<p>We have added the explanation of these abbreviations.</p> <p>This passage has been rewritten.</p> <p>Line 22, 25, 26, 33, 38</p> <p>We have revised this manuscript as reviewer's comments.</p> <p>Table 1 has given all origins. The Chinese Herbs and plant essential oils were purchased from Sichuan Mianyang Kelun Pharmacy and YakYeTi Aromatic Pharmaceutical Technology (Qingdao) Co., Ltd.</p> <p>We have supplemented with suppliers in this paragraph.</p> <p>Line 62/66, 64/65/67, 70</p> <p>We have revised this manuscript as reviewer's comments.</p> <p>We added a new section, 2.7 Statistical Analyses, explaining the repetitions.</p> <p>This sentence has been revised, and a description has been added.</p> <p>The minimum inhibitory concentration(MIC) is an index to measure the antibacterial activity of an antibacterial drug, which refers to the lowest drug concentration that can inhibit the growth of pathogenic bacteria in the medium after culturing bacteria in vitro for 18 to 24 hours.</p> <p>Gradient dilution: for example, make 1g into 100ml, take 1ml and then dilute it into 100ml so that a solution of 0.1g/l is obtained.</p> <p>Line 99</p> <p>A typo, already edited</p> <p>In the last paragraph of section 2.5(Line 117), we have described, "By determining the clearance rate and absorbance value of different concentrations, the concentration for 50% of maximal effect, (EC50) was calculated, respectively."</p> <p>Line 109, 126, 127, 128, 131,147</p> <p>We have revised this manuscript as reviewer's comments.</p> <p>We added a new section, 2.7 Statistical Analyses, explaining the repetitions.</p>

Review Form 1.6

	<p>Line 139: Can you offer some literature please? Did other research teams find the same?</p> <p>Line 144: Can you please offer some literature? Is this target for antioxidant development new? Did other research groups find similar? Maybe with different methods? This would be very interesting to discuss here!</p> <p>Line 145: Please show some literature for discussion of the performance of essential oils.</p> <p>Line 155: please discuss proved by this result. Can you offer some literature?</p> <p>Line 171: Can you please give some literature?</p> <p>In 3. Results and Discussion you present your results, but I cannot find a discussion. Please compare your results to other research groups/literature and highlight your findings.</p> <p>Line 153: is higher than what? Please finish your sentence.</p> <p>Line 172: Please explain the correlation between your results and the fact that it has been used in cosmetics.</p> <p>Please draw lines to possible effects and the impact on <i>P. acnes</i> or if possible on acne as disease. What would be the next steps to use your results? How did other research groups go on?</p> <p>Tables 3,4,5: Please provide standard errors. How often did you repeat the experiments?</p>	<p>Line 139,144,145,155, 171</p> <p>We have added other research teams' results and had some discussion.</p> <p>We have revised this manuscript as reviewer's comments.</p> <p>A typo, already edited</p> <p>We have explained this problem in the article.</p> <p>In the last paragraph, we added our future aim.</p> <p>We have revised this manuscript as reviewer's comments.</p>
Minor REVISION comments	<p>Whole Article: Please stay consistent with the spelling of the personal names of bacteria and herbs. Please stay also consistent with researchers names you cite (family name, first letter of forename, <i>et al.</i>) Please stay consistent with indications of sizes – sometimes you use a space character in between and sometimes not.</p> <p>Line 107: two space characters before formula</p> <p>Line 128: two space characters before (21,43mm)</p> <p>Line 131: two space characters before the above...</p> <p>Line 134: please remove the before <i>Tricholoma</i></p> <p>Line 136: two space characters before <i>Lavandula</i>...</p> <p>Line 176: two space characters before <i>Boletus</i>...</p>	<p>We have revised this manuscript as reviewer's comments.</p>
Optional/General comments	<p>Dear Authors,</p> <p>Please provide some more statistical analysis to highlight your results. Please use some more literature to underline your findings.</p> <p>Thank you!</p>	

PART 2:

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?	(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)	