

Review Form 1.7

|                          |  |
|--------------------------|--|
| Journal Name:            | Asian Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Research  |
| Manuscript Number:       | Ms_AJFAR_111617  |
| Title of the Manuscript: | Effects of the substitution level of soybean meal by Chromolaena odorata leaves powder on the survival rate and growth characteristics of Clarias jaensis (Boulenger, 1909) juveniles in ponds |
| Type of the Article      | Original Research Article  |

PART 1: Review Comments

|  | Reviewer's comment  | Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here) |
|--|---|---|
| <p><b>Compulsory</b> REVISION comments</p> <p>1. Is the manuscript important for scientific community?<br/>(Please write few sentences on this manuscript)</p> <p>2. Is the title of the article suitable?<br/>(If not please suggest an alternative title)</p> <p>3. Is the abstract of the article comprehensive?</p> <p>4. Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?</p> <p>5. Do you think the manuscript is scientifically correct?</p> <p>6. Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestion of additional references, please mention in the review form.</p> <p><u>(Apart from above mentioned 6 points, reviewers are free to provide additional suggestions/comments)</u></p> | <p>This manuscript reported the application of plant based ingredient in the fish feed to support the growth of the fish. The findings of the study can benefit the farmer and researcher to in breeding catfish.</p> <p>The title was ok but a bit confusing with term pond. Is the trial conducting in pond or tank?</p> <p>The abstract is fairly good.</p> <p>The structure of the paper is appropriate.</p> <p>Yes.</p> <p>The references are sufficient. Consider to replace the old one with the latest references. (2000-2024 only)</p> |   |
| <p><b>Minor</b> REVISION comments</p> <p>1. Is language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</p>  | <p>The language is fairly okay.</p>   |   |
| <p><b>Optional/General</b> comments</p>  | <p>In the introduction, please consider adding a few info about the plant. Has this plant not been used before in aquaculture? Add few info regarding the therapeutic uses of this plant for the fish such as amino acid, protein etc. Add past studies that used plants as a replacement meal in feed ingredients.</p> <p>When first mentioning a species name, write it in full. Such as <i>Clarias jaensis</i>. Next mention, write it as <i>C. jaensis</i></p> <p>Please see other comments and suggestions in the paper.</p>               |   |

Review Form 1.7

PART 2:

|  |   |   |
|--|---|---|
|  | Reviewer's comment  | Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here) |
| Are there ethical issues in this manuscript? | (If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details) |   |

Reviewer Details:

|                                  |   |
|----------------------------------|---|
| Name:                            | Nor Hafizah Zakaria   |
| Department, University & Country | Institute of Climate Adaptation and Marine Biotechnology, Universiti Malaysia, Malaysia |