

Review Form 1.7

Journal Name:	Asian Journal of Research in Agriculture and Forestry
Manuscript Number:	Ms_AJRAF_110891
Title of the Manuscript:	Moisture Harvesting Structures Enhance Survival and Growth Performance of Multi-Purpose Tree Seedlings in Semi-Arid Hillsides of Tigray, Ethiopia
Type of the Article	Opinion Article

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Compulsory REVISION comments 1. Is the manuscript important for scientific community? (Please write few sentences on this manuscript) 2. Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title) 3. Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? 4. Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate? 5. Do you think the manuscript is scientifically correct? 6. Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestion of additional references, please mention in the review form. <u>(Apart from above mentioned 6 points, reviewers are free to provide additional suggestions/comments)</u>	<p>This manuscript does not examine new material. It seems that the title of the article needs to be edited. it is suggested: "Investigation of moisture collection structures and introduction of resistant tree species in the semi-arid slopes of Tigray, Ethiopia" The abstract of the article needs to be revised. In fact, it should present the general results of the article in an attractive and concise manner to encourage the audience to read the article. For example, this sentence seems unnecessary: "The moisture harvesting structures were assigned to the main plots and the tree seedlings as the sub-plots." The subsections and structure of the manuscript are appropriate. Most of the references and sources used are old, and this has reduced the freshness of the article. References such as the following list can greatly contribute to the scientific load of the article: Asmelash T, Alemayehu H, Getahun Y, Shimelis T (2020). Evaluation of multi-functional fodder tree and shrub species in mid-altitudes of South Omo Zone, Southern Ethiopia. Journal of Horticulture and Forestry 12(1) Bira C, Musa A, Robe E (2021). Performance Evaluation of Multipurpose Tree Species Integrated with Moisture Conservation Structures on Degraded Area Closure District, Ethiopia. Journal of Water Resources and Ocean Science 10(1) Dessale W, Fantaw Y, Shiferaw A (2020). Effect of Integrated Soil and Water Conservation Practices on Vegetation Cover Change and Soil Loss Reduction in Southern Ethiopia. American Journal of Environmental Protection 9(3) Gebremariam YD, Mulubrehan K, Girmay D (2018).Effect of soil and water conservation on rehabilitation of degraded lands and crop productivity in Maego watershed, North Ethiopia. Journal of Degraded and Mining Lands Management 5(3) Ombega NJ, Mureithi SM, Koech OK, Karuma AN, Gachene CKK (2017). Effect of rangeland rehabilitation on the herbaceous species composition and diversity in Suswa catchment, Narok County, Kenya. Ecological Processes 6(41)</p>	
Minor REVISION comments 1. Is language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?	It is understandable.	
Optional/General comments	<p>The first part provided the effect of the moisture harvesting structures on survival rate and growth of tree seedlings. The second part focused on identification of the best tree species survived for the area without supporting with any moisture harvesting structures. The third point also identified the best moisture harvesting structure that fits with which tree species for survival and growth rate. The final result discussed on identification of the effective pit position from the water collection ditch by the structure so that the moisture will be easily accessed by the root hairs of the planted seedlings.</p>	

Review Form 1.7

PART 2:

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?	(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Arash Vaghef Koodehi
Department, University & Country	Kashan University, Institute of Nanoscience and Nanotechnology, Iran