

Review Form 1.7

Journal Name:	Asian Journal of Research in Surgery
Manuscript Number:	Ms_AJRS_95874
Title of the Manuscript:	Surgical treatment of keloids in the ear: prospective and randomized study comparing direct surgical excision vs. Keloid Fillet Flap
Type of the Article	prospective and randomized study

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<https://www.journalajrs.com/index.php/AJRS/editorial-policy>)

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<p>Compulsory REVISION comments</p> <p>1. Is the manuscript important for scientific community? (Please write few sentences on this manuscript)</p> <p>2. Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)</p> <p>3. Is the abstract of the article comprehensive?</p> <p>4. Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?</p> <p>5. Do you think the manuscript is scientifically correct?</p> <p>6. Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestion of additional references, please mention in the review form.</p> <p>(Apart from above mentioned 6 points, reviewers are free to provide additional suggestions/comments)</p>	<p>The manuscript contains important informations for the scientific community, This is a prospective randomized study of a single center with patients with keloids in the auricular area. The primary mechanism for keloid generation is the increased synthesis or smaller reabsorption of collagen caused by a relative decrease in collagen production or direct inhibition of such an enzyme. There is a great variety of treatments, no monotherapy is adequate, and the best therapy is still prevention.</p> <p>The participant patients of the study were randomly divided into two groups: direct surgical excision-RC (n = 36 patients); and the group Keloid Fillet Flap-KFF (n = 37 patients). In both groups, neoadjuvant treatment of infiltration with triamcinolone 20 mg/ml until the end of the clinical activity of the keloid was performed. The treatments followed the adjuvant treatment of 10 sessions of Beta Ray Therapy.</p> <p>Following the use of the scar measuring scales to define the recurrence rate, the study demonstrated a recurrence rate of the total sample of 62%, with the KFF group presenting a rate of 76% and the RC group presenting a rate of 40%. Wounds with volumes greater than 50 cm³ have high recurrence rates. The study also showed that the average wound volumes that were not recurrent in the RC group were 1,6 cm³, and in the KFF group, 13 cm³, and this difference was statistically significant.</p> <p>The title is suitable. The abstract of the article is comprehensive. Subsections and structure of the manuscript are appropriate. The manuscript scientifically correct. The references are sufficient and recent.</p>	
<p>Minor REVISION comments</p> <p>1. Is language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</p>	Yes	
<p>Optional/General comments</p>	<p>page 12:</p> <p>A systematic review, comparing the use of radiotherapy and corticosteroid infiltration adjuvant to excision of ear keloids, published by Shin <i>et al.</i> on-September²³, showed ...</p>	

PART 2:

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<p>Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?</p>	<p><i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i></p>	

[Review Form 1.7](#)

Reviewer Details:

Name:	János Hunyady
Department, University & Country	University of Debrecen, Hungary